

Report and Recommendations

Central Department for WTO Affairs: Work Process and Productivity Analysis

PREPARED BY

ATR Project

SUBMITTED TO

Ministry of Foreign Trade

USAID

SUBMITTED BY

Nathan Associates Inc

UNDER CONTRACT NO.

PCE-I-00-98-00016-00

Task Order 827

May 13, 2004



Contents

Executive Summary	4
CD/WTO Staff Review	6
Areas of Productivity Improvements	8
Administrative Work Processes	8
Managerial Work Processes	11
Technical Work Processes	13
Technical Office	13
Trade Facilitation and Transparency in Government Procurement	15
Non-Agricultural Market Access	15
Competition Policy and Investment	17
Dispute Settlement	17
Accession	18
WTO Rules	19
Intellectual Property Rights	19
Agriculture	20
Services	21
Next Steps/Sequencing Change	23

Executive Summary

Task

To assess productivity of CD/WTO staff and recommend ways to improve productivity.

Background

Since its inception as the WTO unit, the CD/WTO has developed from scratch a core number of capable staff with a solid knowledge base and solid work habits and who have further improved greatly in the past couple of years. However, whether old or new, staff have not yet fulfilled their potential. Furthermore, many new personnel have recently been added to the CD/WTO and heads of the Trade Agreements Sector and CD/WTO noted an overall lack of productivity of staff. Therefore, they requested that the ATR Trade Specialist review CD/WTO staff and their work and then outline the reasons for the lack of productivity and make work process recommendations.

Methodology

The ATR Trade Specialist discussed administrative, managerial, and technical work process issues with each CD/WTO staff member. As part of this effort workplan ideas were developed and possible areas of productivity enhancements were discussed. Where possible, staff were observed at work, either during this evaluation or in the normal course of work if evaluation time did not allow for proper observation. This should not be considered a formal evaluation of staff because only an effective performance appraisal system based on well developed workplans and objectives can properly accomplish that task (not to mention that the consultant cannot in a few observations make an accurate assessment of employees' performance). Nevertheless some judgment is made about staff's ability and willingness to perform work assigned. Main strengths and weaknesses are outlined for each staff in the appendix. That appendix includes comments as to the employee's value to the CD/WTO and areas of improvement.

Findings

Though the vast majority of staff are able to do the work they are assigned, absence of a workplan, a lack of initiative and critical thinking, a lack of strong training systems for new staff, a difficult work environment, a lack of an effective performance evaluation system, and several administrative bottlenecks significantly affect their productivity. It is recommended that appropriate administrative and managerial systems, often at the Sector level, be put in place immediately to encourage "workplanning" and excellent output, differentiate between good and poor performers, cut time spent in non-productive activities, encourage department and sub-department planning and monitoring meetings, and implement training methods for new staff, including rotation through all the different groups before a new employee is given a final assignment. Technically, the majority of staff spend most of their time summarizing information rather than adding value through critical analysis. Intensive commercial diplomacy training is needed immediately for new and relatively new staff. It is proposed that in implementing the new CD/WTO structure, ATR work with each General Department to

develop a workplan (with timeline to achieve tasks) in the areas of coordinating negotiations, coordinating compliance, and conducting public awareness. ATR would then work more closely to help CD/WTO departments implement these workplans and improve the value added element of their work.

Report

This report assesses areas of possible productivity improvements. It begins with a staff review, then looks at administrative, managerial, and technical work processes, suggesting in each case areas that could be improved.

CD/WTO Staff Review

ATR was asked by the management of the Trade Agreements Sector and CD/WTO to perform a systematic review of the performance of the CD/WTO staff. This was done through group and individual discussions with staff and observations of their work. Discussions involved the technical work that employees are involved in, and bottlenecks that they face administratively, managerially, and technically.

It should be emphasized from the outset that this is not an official evaluation of CD/WTO personnel. While some judgment is made regarding ability, willingness, and main strengths and weaknesses of staff because it was part of the task requested, only an appropriate performance appraisal system based on defined and agreed performance criteria can properly do the job. Whereas most employees have both general ability and willingness to do the job, many, particularly new staff, have not yet developed the necessary knowledge to become productive. Certainly, none have yet reached their full potential. It is, therefore, potentially misleading to evaluate their performance in this manner. A “training system” for new staff needs to be developed urgently (discussed in next section). This arrangement should include a system of rotation through the different groups for new staff to see where the best fit might be and to better understand what all the groups do. For new staff and relatively new staff, it also has to include intensive commercial diplomacy training to better understand trade economics, trade policy, and the WTO.

Though “old” staff have developed a system of work – mostly by responding to correspondence –, there has not been much emphasis on taking the initiative based on overall CD/WTO objectives. For old and new staff, critical thinking needs to be encouraged. Indeed, these criteria need to be taken into consideration in any performance appraisal system that is established in the future. In addition, while ability and willingness are key determinants of productivity, other elements mentioned in the next sections collectively have an important impact.

Several other observations should be made about critical needs of staff that came out during this review:

- ***Data sources and basic research:*** A critical number of CD/WTO staff need to be briefed on sources of data, including World Bank, TradeMap, CD-ROMs, and many websites. They also need to be shown useful internet search engines for general or specific searches.
- ***News sources:*** A critical number of CD/WTO staff do not know how to access news on the WTO. Staff should at the very least subscribe to Bridges Weekly and news from the WTO. The BNA WTO Reporter subscription does not seem to be used much, even though it consists of up to date news and analysis. Worldtradelaw.net (summaries of dispute cases) could also be used more effectively. Many staff, in the process of this review, became subscribers to Bridges Weekly and WTO news.
- ***Commercial diplomacy:*** A critical number of CD/WTO staff, though they may have been with the department for many months, need intensive courses in commercial diplomacy (this staff did not benefit from earlier commercial diplomacy courses held

by DEPRA and ATR). Such courses would explain basic economic and trade concepts and give them proper background on the WTO and its agreements.

- ***Conversational English:*** A critical number of CD/WTO staff need to practice their spoken English. Besides conversational English classes, some thought should be given to having a voluntary “English-only” day at the office for those who want to practice.
- ***New staff:*** At this time there seem to be enough (perhaps too many) CD/WTO staff. If more staff are to be recruited, some thought should be given to transferring certain current Ministry staff to the CD/WTO and using new staff elsewhere. This would allow the Ministry to better use the existing skills, particularly in English and WTO matters, of its staff.¹

Results of the staff review are shown in the Appendix.

¹ Provided that moving them from another department would not be a problem, these could include, for example, Noha Ali Khalifa, Nermeen Meligui, Noha Nofal, and Iman Ayoub. Their English is very good; their WTO skills are quite good since they have received commercial diplomacy training; they are all pursuing Masters degrees; and they are not using all these skills (particularly English) in their current work.

Areas of Productivity Improvements

Productivity can be defined as the rate of output per unit of input. In terms of labor, it represents how much of a product a person can make in a unit of time.² CD/WTO staff are productive if they perform their work effectively (doing the right things) and efficiently (doing things right and fast), and if they are assigned to activities that match their skills. Doing the work effectively first implies that it is clear what staff are supposed to do. Job descriptions, training, and, more importantly, workplans that list and detail what needs to be done, by whom, and when are needed to help staff work effectively. To work efficiently staff need discipline, a conducive work environment, training (computer, technical, managerial, etc.), motivation, and the right computer and administrative tools. This report looks at three areas where improvements could lead to important productivity gains, namely administrative, managerial, and technical work processes. Comments regarding whether activities match skills are made either in the staff review or in the technical work processes.

Though there is no separate section for work environment, mainly because it is an area currently outside of management's control, issues such as lack of space, chairs, desks, filing cabinets, air conditioning, and computers; loud noise from colleagues, cell phones, and doors; rats and other animals/insects, four odors, and excessive dust can be detrimental to productivity. These issues need to be discussed, planned, and resolved before the move into the new Ministry building. They also cannot be dismissed as mere excuses as they seem to affect good performers more so than the rest of the staff, forcing them to do most of the work after regular work hours (when many are trying to study for their Masters courses).

Another note should be made regarding the number of employees currently at the CD/WTO. It seems the work being done right now could be done by half (maybe less) of the current staff. More CD/WTO staff does not (and did not) translate into increased individual productivity. In fact, because of the increased number of employees in the past few months and lack of space, individual productivity has actually decreased. However, there is a lot of work (as is discussed in the technical work processes section) that should be done and which will likely demand significant effort from all staff.

Finally, absenteeism was significant during the observation period. While improved discipline (see performance appraisal system discussion) can help improve attendance, a management system that emphasizes adherence to workplans, employee accountability and responsibility, and a well-designed and implemented performance appraisal system that encourages good performers and discourages poor performers is also needed.

ADMINISTRATIVE WORK PROCESSES

Though not any one issue from the list below causes sizeable productivity problems, they collectively have a very important effect on productivity and sometimes on morale. Streamlining these processes would significantly reduce the time wasted in administrative issues so that staff could focus on technical ones. It is important that one person be appointed to head all TAS administration and s/he be put in charge of implementing the recommendations below. At the CD/WTO level, the Executive Office should have a General

² Source: www2.ucsc.edu/atlas/glossary.html

Manager whose job is to follow up all administrative and technical issues related to the CD/WTO, and an executive secretary that organizes the head of CD/WTO's files, keeps his schedule, and performs other duties.

- ***Transport and Travel:*** Administrative support for local and overseas travel, including the obtaining of visas, travel documents, etc. A CD/WTO employee spends much of the week leading up to a trip abroad trying to get tickets, per diem, visa, Ministerial decree, etc., instead of spending that time on technical preparations and briefings. This is a source of wasted time. Recommendation: While staff would still have to oversee/participate in the process, it would make sense to have a travel office for TAS, which would facilitate all issues related to staff travel overseas (but could also coordinate local movement of Ministry vehicles). ECS has such an office and we could borrow from their experience.
- ***Correspondence System:*** all aspects including mail, filing, classification, tracking, mail room, housing and storage, etc. Improvements are being effected currently to make tracking and storage more automated. Recommendation: While automation is being implemented, a simple Excel spreadsheet with appropriate fields that is updated by senders and recipients of correspondence would be sufficient. The agriculture group has put in place such a spreadsheet.
- ***Filing System:*** A system for cataloguing all documents collected and produced by CD/WTO staff as part of their work. Hundreds, perhaps thousands, of file folders are housed at the CD/WTO; many of which around, under, and above staff desks. Disorganized and incomplete files can waste the time of staff and supervisors. Recommendation: The filing system needs to be looked at by a specialist.³ Though much original communication is generated or received by the CD/WTO, an important percentage of files is simply downloaded from websites (mainly the WTO website). Such files can be kept electronically on the computer network, which, in addition to saving physical space, would make them easily accessible to others. For other communication, a simple check-in/check-out system where a person that borrows a document or file writes his/her name along with date of check-out and return should be sufficient to prevent stress caused by non-returned documents. Old files, anything older than a year, should be scanned and kept electronically on DVDs with hard copies kept off site.
- ***Personnel Administration:*** work hours (flexible time, compensation time), attendance, overtime, leave, etc. There are several issues to be considered in this area. First, whether someone begins work at 8:30 a.m. or 9:00 a.m., s/he is on record as having come at 9 a.m. Second, some have to leave at 3 p.m. while others leave at 5 p.m. and others stay beyond 5 p.m. According to staff, whether someone works 12 hour or 6 hour days is not reflected in compensation or even verbally recognized. Third, though it is understood that some circumstances dictate that staff stay longer hours, those staff do not receive compensation time (i.e. get to come later the next day or take a day off later). Fourth, it is unclear to staff what the criteria are to graduate from "contractor" to "employee" and whether these are adhered to. Though it is understood that sometimes exceptions have to be made, too many exceptions can lead

³ Mustafa Sebai could help initially with this task as he has had much experience with filing in his previous place of work.

to low morale. Fifth, absenteeism seems to be very high (which can be both a symptom and cause of low productivity). A good performance appraisal system would reward good attendance and discourage absenteeism. Recommendations: Though many personnel rules are mandated by the Government, many rules need to be reviewed so that they do not have as negative an impact on morale (and consequently on productivity) as they do now. Flexible work hours (if someone needs to leave at 3 p.m., s/he should be able to begin at 7 a.m.), compensation time (if have to work on Saturday, should be able to get weekday off some other time when there is less work), and an adequate performance appraisal system need to be considered. There also needs to be a much better/automated system of tracking attendance (as staff often sign for each other, especially when the head of CD/WTO is on travel). Finally, all personnel information, in addition to a list of Ministry contacts, forms, structure, etc. should be distributed to all staff and made available on the intranet.

- ***Office Management and Supplies:*** stationery, furniture, equipment, office cleaning, messenger services, etc. Many staff pay for supplies (e.g. staplers, staple removers, clips, etc.) out of their own funds, either because they are not available at the Ministry or because they do not know the system for getting them. Paper is especially hard to find. Though CD/WTO staff understand the Ministry's budget limitations, they should not be expected to use their own money to pay for supplies. Much time is also wasted looking for supplies. Recommendation: There needs to be one person responsible for office supplies at the Sector level and one person at CD/WTO that receives and fulfills office supply requests from CD/WTO staff.
- ***Enquiries and Visitors:*** personal time schedules, meetings, VIP visitors, general enquiries, conference facilities, etc. Considerable time can be wasted looking for staff who are in training, taking a leave of absence, or simply in a meeting outside of the office. Training can be set up only to find out that key people are not available. Meetings have to be held in the middle of the staff rooms. Recommendations: It should be possible to have one easily accessible electronic master schedule that keeps track of staff whereabouts. One person (perhaps the General Manager) in the Executive Office should be tasked with keeping it up to date. CD/WTO staff should be able to use the ERC conference room for meeting purposes.
- ***Communication:*** telephones, fax, internet, intranet, etc. There is currently only one telephone in the office, located at the head of CD/WTO's office, that can dial outside. This means that the head of CD/WTO is constantly interrupted, that employees postpone their phone calls to when he is not in, or that staff use their cell phones to make work related calls. There is also one internal phone set in each of the three staff rooms. The CD/WTO website content has been ready in English and Arabic for many months but the new government domain name is not up yet. There is not one place where all internal CD/WTO procedures (leave, structure, files, etc.) and contacts can be found. Recommendations: Though there is a risk that it would be used for personal calls as well, at least one phone that can dial outside should be put in each room. Staff should not have to make work-related calls using their own cell phones, interrupt their supervisor constantly, or postpone their work-related calls unnecessarily. In addition, with public outreach efforts, more people are beginning to call CD/WTO to ask for information. The head of CD/WTO should not be the one to answer them, particularly since he does not have a secretary. Though the CD/WTO website will be up shortly, an intranet that could make a lot of internal procedures and contacts available would

make administration easier. It would also show office rules (regarding, for example, smoking, music, using cell phones, etc.)

- **Public Relations:** conferences, templates, styles, newsletters, logos, etc. There is no one at the Sector level, as far as we know, that systematically helps staff organize conferences, makes sure major publications are professional and consistent in style, and interacts with the press, which often become the tasks of the TAS head. When staff need to write letters to the Minister, Ambassadors, etc., they have to scramble to find the right template and often spend a long time turning out a simple letter. Recommendations: There needs to be at the TAS level a public relations office that helps organize conferences, deals with the press, and makes sure that TAS reports, newsletters, websites, templates, etc. are professional and consistent in style.
- **Submission of Memos/Reports/Letters to Heads of TAS and FTPS:** One of the major learning opportunities for CD/WTO staff is to spend time justifying arguments to the heads of CD/WTO, TAS, and FTPS. However, before being let in to see the heads of sectors, staff can spend hours going back and forth and waiting in offices for their turn. This can waste a lot of time. Recommendations: One possible solution is to designate one hour each day, say 10-11 a.m., where CD/WTO staff that have a document to be signed or submitted go to see the head of the Sector at the same time (which would also save time for the head of the Sector and allow others to see what their colleagues are working on).
- **IT Support:** Though IT support itself seems to be good and fast, the internet is often down; many computers do not have WinZip to send and receive large files; several computers do not have Acrobat Reader to read PDF files; and many staff play video games during work hours (especially Solitaire). Recommendations: Though many games can be downloaded through the internet, all games that come pre-installed in the computers should be deleted. All computers should have WinZip and Acrobat Reader. The network problem should now be resolved.

MANAGERIAL WORK PROCESSES

While improvements in administrative work processes would yield important productivity improvements, they do entail some costs, including hiring administrative staff and investing in automation. Improvements in managerial work processes would also entail costs, but mostly in terms of management's time and commitment to change.

- **Workplan System:** CD/WTO staff spend a lot of time either summarizing WTO documents or responding to other correspondence. There is very little proactive work being done (except in rare cases), critical thinking, or planning for the future. As a result, staff are often either reacting to the latest emergency or sitting idle. Because there is no workplan, staff do not know what is expected of them on a day-to-day basis and their performance over a period of time is hard to judge. A workplan system is also useful because employees have a chance to give input into their work, rather than wait for someone to tell them what to do. Recommendation: A workplan system needs to be started as soon as possible. An annual workplan should be drafted using the new CD/WTO structure, where General Department heads work with individual departments to draft a workplan for each general department. Staff will be responsible for accomplishing their assigned work within the deadlines in the workplan. With

such a system in place, staff can better judge whether to spend extra hours at work (which are mostly forced on them right now because of continuous emergencies), work from home, or be more productive in the office.

- ***Job Descriptions:*** CD/WTO staff do not know what is expected of them, particularly when they are still new to the job. Heads of the groups do not know how their jobs differ from those of their colleagues. Recommendations: Job descriptions should be drafted for heads of general departments, departments, and for technical staff. Using tasks in these job descriptions and specific activities defined in the workplans, performance criteria should be defined for each staff to increase accountability.
- ***Performance Appraisal System:*** The current Ministry employee performance appraisal system is inadequate. It neither sets objectives for staff to meet nor is it used to differentiate between staff. Employees are judged based on generic criteria and are all rated excellent. Salaries do not appear to reflect efforts or performance of staff. Recommendations: Though the current appraisal system is mandated by the Ministry, a system that defines and rewards good performance and discourages poor performance (with real consequences) needs to be put in place. Performance criteria will need to be defined.
- ***Positive/Negative Reinforcement:*** There seems to be little encouragement – aside from additional work – for initiative or high quality work. Simple verbal encouragement for a job well done can improve productivity. Recommendations: Absent monetary rewards (and even with them), at the very least, good performance by groups or individuals should be rewarded with a “job well done” and recognition in front of others. Supervisors should also encourage and make use of staff pursuing their Masters degrees, for example by asking them what is being learned and how it can be applied to work situations.
- ***Staff Meetings:*** Though the head of CD/WTO organizes staff meetings for important issues, meetings should be more frequent and systematic. Intra-CD meetings would help share information and resources, inform others about who is working on what, and serve as a forum for new ideas and innovations. Recommendations: Intra-general department meetings should be held on a weekly basis to make sure there is progress in implementing the workplan and discuss any problems; meetings between general department heads and head of CD/WTO should be held every two weeks to discuss future planning and upcoming important events; and full-staff meetings should be held at least every two weeks to discuss progress in each area of the workplan, recognize good performers, discuss upcoming events, or to present important work of the CD.
- ***Training and Orientation for New Staff:*** Though senior staff are doing their best to integrate new staff into the CD, there is no system to help the new staff integrate faster and be more productive. Recommendations: First, each newcomer should be paired with a mentor (preferably a senior) who will help answer questions about the CD, the Sector, the Ministry, and the type of work that the CD/WTO does. Second, there needs to be a basic training package on the WTO, information on the CD/WTO, papers on trade economics/trade law, trade data sources, and information available at the ERC that all newcomers to the CD/WTO must read. Third, each sector group should prepare some basic training material on their technical area. Fourth,

newcomers should spend 2-4 weeks in each department/group to better understand each topic, get to know each group, and get a better sense of the linkages between the technical areas. Fifth, once a newcomer has finished his/her rotation, he/she would meet with the head of CD/WTO who decides, upon consultations with heads of general departments, where the newcomer is a best fit.

- ***Linkage with ECS Staff:*** Certainly one area where improvements have been made but where more is needed are in the interaction between CD/WTO and ECS staff. The ECS employee on the CD/WTO agriculture team constitutes a model of synergies that can be achieved between the two organizations. However, interaction between CD/WTO staff and ECS (Cairo or Geneva) staff are still not optimal. Recommendations: First, ECS staff need to be connected to the network to enable them to do their work (this is in process). Second, ECS staff that work with CD/WTO should ideally be the ones that are sent to Geneva eventually. Third, much communication between CD/WTO and ECS Geneva seems to go through the Minister. A new chapter needs to be started where CD/WTO and ECS Geneva work collaboratively for the benefit of Egypt. This should begin by a clear delineation of responsibilities for staff in each organization (to include Ministry of Foreign Affairs staff).⁴

TECHNICAL WORK PROCESSES

This section summarizes for each CD/WTO group the current work processes, recommendations as to how work in each group should be organized, and suggested key tasks for a workplan. Elements of the workplan are derived from the key functions of the CD/WTO, namely coordinating negotiations, coordinating compliance, and conducting public awareness and were discussed with each group. As mentioned earlier, too much time is spent simply summarizing (and translating) information. Value-added should be in distilling which documents need to be looked at (some just need to be filed) and thinking critically about how information in a document can somehow benefit Egypt. Another observation to be made about work processes is that it is critical that each group establish close links with other Ministries and private sector groups or individuals. Several groups, such as agriculture and services, have made important strides in these regards. In the end the CD/WTO serves the interests of the Egyptian trading community and this cannot be done without significant outreach to outside groups using as many tools as possible (e.g. workshops, email, website, newsletter, press, etc.). Not only would the trading community benefit from this outreach but the CD/WTO groups would also better understand Egyptian laws in many different sectors and might begin to be involved in policy discussions in the long-term.

Technical Office

- Major work processes
 - Summarize Bridges Weekly, Third World Network news, ECS reports from Geneva, reports from General Council meetings, etc.
 - Keep updated “matrix” of developments in WTO Members’ positions in all aspects of the negotiations

⁴ Interaction with ECS will be reviewed again as part of an upcoming memorandum about the USTR trade policy formulation process and lessons for Egypt.

- Manage High National Committee process, including forwarding minutes of meetings to members and Minister
- Keep updated training “matrix” showing training taken by each CD/WTO staff
- Participate in OECD meetings and negotiations related to subsidies issues
- Recommendations
 - Technical Office’s mission needs to be better defined. The TO should be in charge of coordinating overlapping technical issues, including Trade Policy Reviews, High National Committee, General Council meetings, and possibly Accessions, but also overlapping administrative issues, including training, CD/WTO website, intranet, newsletter, and correspondence templates. It should continue providing technical advice to the head of CD/WTO on overlapping technical issues or upon request from the Minister or head of TAS.
 - Included in its TPR work, the Technical Office should coordinate with other staff the review of key Member TPRs and provide input to the TPR process.
 - In training the Technical Office needs to become the principal channel of communication for training and all proposed and implemented training courses should be recorded in the training matrix. Attendance, grades, certificates, etc. for each individual should be recorded in the matrix.
 - In the HNC process, the Technical Office needs to attend all HNC meetings and gradually be given the opportunity to provide technical input to the head of CD/WTO on negotiations.
 - Technical Office should design and publish a monthly WTO Newsletter featuring a different topic in each issue. It should coordinate submission of material to the CD/WTO website.
 - Technical Office should design the CD/WTO intranet to include HNC contact database; CD/WTO staff database; templates for memos, letters, and reports; training material by subject area; travel documents; correspondence tracking sheet; etc.
 - Though some information needs to be summarized, this should not take a large percentage of staff’s time (this goes for all staff not just the Technical Office). All staff should be encouraged to subscribe to and read different news sources.
 - With this expanded mandate the Technical Office would need to be expanded in terms of staff. It will also need a group leader to distribute and coordinate the work. Though Noha is a self-starter, Amr will need guidance and supervision. Unless one of the seniors can be made group leader, Noha would be a good candidate for the position. Other staff members need to be self-starters and dynamic, and be knowledgeable about WTO agreements.
- Suggested tasks for workplan
 - Draft and disseminate monthly WTO Newsletter
 - Provide technical and design input into CD/WTO website
 - With the TAS and ATR IT staff design and implement CD/WTO intranet
 - Design and disseminate templates for memos, letters, reports, etc.
 - Compile HNC contact database (in a way that can be used to merge files); attend HNC meetings; make sure HNC members are constantly up to date
 - List WTO Members being reviewed in 2004 and 2005, and begin to solicit input in coordination with CD/BMA and ECS on their trade policies
 - Begin collecting (or coordinate collection of) information about Egypt’s trade policies in preparation for Egypt’s Trade Policy Review

- Update training matrix to reflect all training that each CD/WTO staff has taken while with the Ministry; note attendance and certificates earned where possible
- Keep negotiating position matrix up to date
- Organize all files, index them, and keep them up to date

Trade Facilitation and Transparency in Government Procurement

- Major work processes
 - Review and summarize reports, studies, memos related to trade facilitation and transparency in government procurement
 - Prepare draft papers providing opinion on different country positions
 - Attend meetings and provide input related to OECD subsidies discussions
 - Attend meetings and conferences related to trade facilitation and transparency in government procurement
- Recommendations
 - Though it is unclear whether trade facilitation and transparency in government procurement will be part of the Single Undertaking, it would be in Egypt's interest to keep exploring whether these discussions would be to its benefit.
 - A workplan needs to be put into effect which has a timeline and job responsibilities for coordinating Egypt's position in the negotiations
- Suggested tasks for the workplan
 - Prepare discussion papers on trade facilitation and transparency in government procurement
 - Disseminate the papers and hold workshops on the two topics, possibly through the FEI workshops, to hear people's views and request feedback
 - Compile database of interested parties in both subject areas
 - Conduct analysis as needed (e.g. cost to business/trade from Egypt's not implementing best practices in trade facilitation; legal adjustments would be required to join the TGP agreement...)
 - Attend WTO meetings on the subject and update constituencies
 - Draft preliminary position and submit to the HNC subcommittee on new issues

NON-AGRICULTURAL MARKET ACCESS

- Major work processes
 - Review and summarize correspondence, reports, notifications, etc. related to NAMA negotiations, the Agreement on Textiles and Clothing, and Customs Valuation
 - Conduct analysis of the impact on Egypt's tariffs of various negotiation proposals
 - Provide opinion on customs valuation disputes with Egyptian customs
 - Participate in adjustments to the HS code and meetings regarding tariff changes, particularly concerning textiles
- Recommendations
 - It seems like a lot of summaries being done (e.g. notifications) are of little benefit, whereas other work should take priority
 - Much work needs to be done in terms of outreach and coordinating negotiating positions, especially in the case of non-tariff barriers

- The group suggested that Hedi should be systematically involved in HS discussions (she is sometimes kept out or not informed of meetings)
- The customs valuation work should move into the Department of Imported Issues with other customs affairs
- Other recommendations are included as part of the workplan discussion below
- Suggested tasks for the workplan (customs valuation tasks would be done by the Department of Imported Issues)
 - Training for CD/WTO team on customs valuation
 - Private sector groups workshops (FEI, freight forwarders), inviting Egyptian Customs as speakers, and maybe a foreign expert to talk about countries' experiences implementing valuation
 - Draft and disseminate (through workshop and website) issue brief on valuation
 - Coordinate with CD/BMA or Technical Office – so they can check other countries' TPRs for possible violations of the customs valuation agreement
 - Within the private sector group workshops ask Egyptian exporters if they are facing valuation issues in other markets and importers whether they are facing valuation issues in Egypt; open email/phone channels between private sector and CD/WTO
 - Need to meet with each FEI chamber, ask them to list/discuss specific Non-Tariff Barriers facing each industry and in which markets (would necessitate preparation of a survey to distribute at the meetings)
 - Continue sectoral analysis – car assembly, chemicals (esp. pharmaceuticals), engineering industries
 - Conduct analysis to select sensitive products for exemption from reduction commitments in the negotiations
 - Once market access formulas are proposed, analyze impact on Egyptian exports to other countries
 - Monitor developments in Committee on Trade and Environment special session for tariff reductions/elimination on environmental goods
 - Coordinate with CD/BMA or Technical Office – so they can check other countries applying tariffs beyond their bound rates (e.g. from TPRs)
 - Through private sector workshops (like the ones with FEI chambers), show operators how to check applied versus bound rates in other countries
 - Website – provide updates on NAMA negotiations and Egypt's participation in the negotiations
 - WTO Newsletter – provide general material on NAMA and Egypt's participation in the negotiations
 - Email news – develop database of contacts through workshops outlined above and email them NAMA negotiations updates
 - Workshops – include with FEI chambers workshops (workshops would thus have three elements: 1) update people on NAMA negotiations, 2) show people how to search for violations of applied vs bound tariffs, and 3) discuss and list NTBs in other markets). Workshop with FEI textiles chamber to present textiles study
 - Provide info on all of the above to FEI so that their members can access them as needed

COMPETITION POLICY AND INVESTMENT

- Major work processes
 - Follow-up TRIMs issues, particularly WTO Members' submissions regarding Egypt's local content law, and Egypt's compliance with the TRIMs agreement
 - Coordinate Egypt's negotiating position in the competition policy and investment discussions at the WTO
 - Review, summarize, respond to positions papers on competition policy and investment in the WTO and UNCTAD
 - Provide comments on Egypt's draft competition law
 - Attend meetings and conferences on competition policy and investment
- Recommendations
 - Since it is now extremely unlikely that there will ever be WTO discussions on competition policy and investment, the group will need to be involved in some other tasks
 - It is recommended that two staff remain involved with TRIMs (but also involve NAMA group in the local content law since they are more familiar with tariff issues) and any other competition policy and investment discussions
 - The rest of the staff should be assigned to issues such as GSP; GSTP; trade, debt, and finance; trade and transfer of technology; civil aircraft; state trading enterprises; balance of payments; and S&D (and other Committee on Trade and Development issues). The group could still remain as one unit.
- Suggested tasks for the workplan
 - Discuss Egypt's local content law with head of FTPS and ways to replace it with WTO-consistent law
 - Conduct interviews with industry and customs to find out the impact and extent of use of Egypt's local content law
 - Outline solution to problem and coordinate with Ministry of Industry and Ministry of Finance
 - Coordinate with other Ministries to educate traders and manufacturers of new policy
 - Outline workplan for other issues (i.e. focus on S&D issues that Egypt cares about and push for solutions at the WTO; sensitize traders about GSP and GSTP; outline difficulties that Egyptian traders had in obtaining trade financing immediately following the floating of the Egyptian Pound and use it as input to the trade, debt, and finance discussions, etc.)

DISPUTE SETTLEMENT

- Major work processes
 - Review and comment on other countries' proposals in the WTO dispute settlement negotiations
 - Respond to other countries' queries on Egypt's subsidies programs
 - Participate in reverse trade remedies cases
- Recommendations
 - An ATR trade law consultant will shortly submit her recommendations as to how best to use TAS's legal team, including on dispute settlement issues
 - Dispute settlement/legal staff should be able to draft proposals, provide sound legal advice, and render legal opinion on a range of trade issues
 - Need to include a system where the legal team reviews panel and appellate body rulings and informs technical groups

- Suggested tasks for the workplan
 - Will depend on the steps to be taken to put a legal team together (including significant training in legal writing)
 - Draft position responding to the latest six-country proposal in the negotiations, especially on areas of interest to developing countries (e.g. litigation costs and Secretariat's assistance to developing countries in dispute cases)
 - Some outreach through the CD/WTO website and newsletter should be useful to educate the public about Egypt's rights under the WTO Dispute Settlement Mechanism

ACCESSION

- Major work processes
 - Analyze offers by acceding countries after those are forwarded by the ECS Geneva office (in conjunction with agriculture, services, and NAMA groups)
 - Summarize working party reports
 - Analyze memoranda of foreign trade regimes
 - Accession group does not participate in Working Party meetings
- Recommendations
 - Group needs to be better informed about activities that need to be undertaken by the group
 - Group needs to be much more proactive in consulting with private sector about acceding countries' offers and trade policies that constitute trade barriers
 - Group needs to interact with ECS overseas offices and possibly with CD/BMA to assemble information and questions to ask of acceding countries
 - There needs to be better communication between ECS Geneva and accession group. Offers should be submitted without delay, electronically if at all possible
 - Once new group members are familiar with the work, each person should become responsible for a mix of high and low/medium priority countries in all areas. They should work with sector groups within CD/WTO (particularly agriculture, services, and NAMA) to analyze offers
 - Because accession involves understanding a broad range of WTO and trade/economic policy issues, accession group needs to get up to speed on all WTO agreements and understand a range of economic and trade concepts
- Suggested tasks for the workplan
 - Bring accession expert to help group better participate in the accession process
 - Find out which accession Working Parties Egypt is member to
 - Prioritize acceding countries into high and medium/low priority according to Egypt's export interest in agriculture, industrial, and services exports and geographic proximity
 - Review all accession documents submitted by priority countries (e.g. question and answers from Working Party meetings, memoranda of foreign trade regimes, etc.)
 - For countries that have already submitted offers, get hold of these offers, analyze them, present summary to private sector groups, get their feedback, and submit questions as appropriate to ECS Geneva office
 - Analyze legislative action plans of priority countries
 - Organize bilateral meetings with priority countries through the ECS Geneva office

- As a matter of priority, private sector meetings (e.g. through FEI or the commodity councils) should be held to hear private sector views on Russian trade policies

WTO RULES

- Major work processes
 - Review, summarize, and respond to proposals in WTO Rules negotiations
 - Analyze proposals in the Ad Hoc committee and suggest position for Egypt
 - Follow and summarize work of all three trade remedies committees at the WTO
 - Participate in trade remedies and dispute cases raised against Egypt
- Recommendations
 - With the addition of two bright new staff in the Rules area, it should be possible over time to decrease the Ministry's reliance on outside counsel, which should be a viable objective
 - Need intensive courses in legal drafting in English
- Suggested tasks for the workplan
 - While Rules negotiations are in informal mode now, perhaps outreach should be undertaken in the area of trade remedies (e.g. through FEI workshop, CD/WTO website, and newsletter) to explain to people the processes used to conduct trade remedy investigations

INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY RIGHTS

- Major work processes
 - Review and summarize papers and proposals related to TRIPS
 - Draft Egypt's positions on issues under TRIPS negotiations and submit/discuss at the HNC
 - Review Law 82 for areas of non-compliance
 - Participate in bilateral (e.g. EFTA) negotiations in IPR-related areas
 - Assist TRIPS contact point
 - Provide input to IPR law (e.g. antiques/monuments)
- Recommendations
 - IPR group needs to follow up Geographical Indications work, i.e. conducting analysis, outreach, and drafting position for the negotiations (per outline agreed with IPR consultant)
 - Need to more firmly establish IPR group within the business community and within the Government
 - Need to establish a link between the CD/WTO IPR group and the USAID IPRA project (extension of SIPRE/TIPRE projects), in order to benefit from training, material, and coordination with key ministries involved in IPR in Egypt
 - There is no need for IPR group to summarize every piece of information from the WTO that relates to IPR. IPR group has enough knowledge to prioritize documentation and correspondence
 - IPR group needs to continue to be actively involved in analysis of compliance
 - There still seems to be tension between the CD/WTO and ECS staff involved in IPR. Not knowing what other issues are involved, Sherif has in terms of technical expertise earned the right to be head of a group, and since IPR is a

complex area that demands continuity, it would make sense that he remain a leader in that group. Though ECS staff are relatively new to the IPR field, they have great interest and are learning gradually (trade and environment is another important area that the ECS staff are working on).

- Suggested tasks for the workplan
 - Continue work on Law 82 compliance with TRIPS
 - Implement GI analysis/awareness/proposal outline suggested by IPR group and IPR consultant
 - Conduct IPR protection cost-benefit analysis, public awareness, and legal analysis on the following topics:
 - Pharmaceuticals (in conjunction with NAMA group)
 - Plants (e.g. traditional knowledge)
 - Antiques/monuments
 - TRIPS compliance

AGRICULTURE

- Major work processes
 - Follow-up all negotiations, compliance, and public awareness issues related to agriculture, SPS (including Cartagena Protocol on LMOs and Convention on Biodiversity), and TBT
 - Review and summarize negotiating proposals, papers, and memos on the agriculture negotiations
 - Conduct outreach on the agriculture agreement through presentations and written publications
 - Conduct analysis of different market access formulas to assess impact on Egypt
 - Conduct survey of tariff and non-tariff constraints facing Egyptian agricultural exports through the Federation of Egyptian Industries
 - Compile database of constraints facing Egyptian agricultural exports in terms of tariffs, export subsidies, domestic support, SPS, and TBT-related constraints
 - Support the enquiry points for SPS at the Ministry of Agriculture and for TBT at the Egyptian Organization for Standardization
 - Track and analyze notifications of other WTO members to the extent feasible
 - Participate in WTO meetings and conferences (including negotiations)
 - Improve administrative affairs, including designing correspondence templates and correspondence tracking system
 - Coordinate HNC meetings on agriculture and standards-issues
- Recommendations
 - The agriculture group is the farthest along in terms of thinking about negotiations, compliance, and public awareness. The next step is to put activities down in terms of a workplan with responsibilities and a timeline
 - The group is also the farthest along in terms of trying to improve administrative processes. While this kind of “proactiveness” is exactly what the CD/WTO needs from all its staff – and, therefore, should be encouraged – these kinds of work processes should normally be done at the TAS-level, at the CD/WTO executive office (maybe by the executive secretary), or at the technical office

- The database of constraints facing Egyptian agriculture exports also should be encouraged. Though the database is now primarily being done to better understand Egypt's position in the negotiations, the results should be made available to trade associations, Ministry of Agriculture, and probably others. For parts of the database, the group should work with USAID agriculture projects (e.g. ALEB) to obtain data and better understand agriculture laws and policies in other countries
- The agriculture group needs to further position itself with the other ministries as the authority on WTO issues. The group could substantially help the Ministry of Agriculture and Ministry of Industry (EOS) in its notifications and obtaining and analyzing information. In return the group would also better understand Egyptian laws and policies related to agriculture, TBT, and SPS
- Suggested tasks for the workplan
 - Conduct cost/benefit analyses on the impact of export competition (export subsidies, food aid, export taxes, export credits and export credit guarantees, state trading enterprises), domestic support, and market access (tariff rate quotas, tariffs, Special Safeguard Mechanism) on key Egyptian agriculture goods
 - Use analysis to draft preliminary positions in the agriculture negotiations
 - Compile contact database and email listserv of stakeholders in agriculture (with field/sectors of interest) and establish/build relationships with key contacts (especially Ministry of Agriculture)
 - Better understand Egypt's subsidy programs (through workshops and discussions with Ministry of Agriculture) and draft notifications to the WTO as appropriate, in coordination with other agencies and the HNC
 - Better understand Egypt's partners subsidy programs through their notifications, trade policy reviews, and other reports
 - Prepare and disseminate issue briefs on agriculture, SPS, and TBT, including descriptions of the issues and updates on the negotiations
 - Post above information on CD/WTO website
 - Build communication lines within the press concerning WTO agreements (not just for agriculture)
 - Conduct workshops for Ministries involved in agriculture, SPS, and TBT, and involve members of the HNC
 - Conduct information sessions for Commodity Councils and other private sector groups

SERVICES

- Major work processes
 - Review and summarize reports, minutes of meetings, proposals of other countries related to the GATS
 - Participate in negotiations and discussions on services with Arab countries and with Euro-Med countries
 - Participate in WTO meetings and conferences (including negotiations meetings and bilateral negotiations)
 - Coordinate HNC subcommittee meetings on the GATS
 - Serve as GATS contact point for Egypt
 - Conduct public outreach on GATS through workshops and meetings
 - Conduct services sector assessments in preparation for GATS negotiations

- Prepare Egypt's requests in the negotiations
- Review offers of other Members, summarize them, present them to HNC subcommittee
- Review Trade Policy Reviews of other countries
- Conduct some administrative tasks (Van Bael and Bellis contracts and invoices and foreign consultants' contract)
- Recommendations
 - The services team needs direction and commitment from the top levels of the Ministry. It is unclear right now what vision/goals the services group is trying to achieve
 - Relationship with ECS Geneva needs to improve immediately. It is having an important impact on the effectiveness of the services group and its input into the negotiations
 - Though outreach on services has been better than that of other groups, a lot more needs to be done to explain the importance of trade in services to Ministries and the business community
 - More private sector individuals should be targeted for the HNC subcommittee. Otherwise, private sector groups, possibly through AmCham, should be targeted for their input and participation
 - The services group should not be working on Trade Policy Reviews and should instead focus on services. Reviewing TPRs is a big job that requires knowledge of all the agreements. It is best left to the Technical Office whose job is in part to follow all the agreements. Likewise, the head of the group should not be working on administrative issues such as contracts or payroll. These tasks should be left to the head of general administration at TAS in the new structure
 - The group needs to receive advanced training on all aspects of the GATS, particularly the new issues and individual services sectors
- Suggested tasks for the workplan
 - Finalize financial services assessment and continue transport services assessment. Conduct other assessments on energy, construction, and tourism services as appropriate
 - Compile contact database and email listserv based on contacts from previous workshops and disseminate information about services via email (including HNC meetings gradually)
 - Continue outreach program through WTO newsletter, CD/WTO website, and workshops/meetings
 - Draft preliminary offers based on the assessments and present to the HNC subcommittee
 - Review and follow-up offers from other members
 - Review and disseminate notifications from other members to stakeholders
 - Continue to build relationships with other Ministries and private sector, especially to be better informed about laws and regulations affecting trade in services
 - Prepare Egypt's notifications to the WTO
 - Prepare task list and information to provide as contact point for the GATS

Next Steps/Sequencing Change

Most of the recommendations in this report have to be implemented or endorsed at the Sector-level, but many will have to be implemented at the CD/WTO level after being endorsed by the head of the Sector. ATR is ready to assist with all recommendations. The following is the recommended sequence for the major recommendations:

Sector-level

- Head of TAS to appoint head of General Department for administration and management
- Head of administration, working with select staff from each CD, to make recommendations and begin implementing improvements in administrative work processes
- Head of TAS to designate person who will work with ATR on developing a performance appraisal system and will implement it

CD/WTO-level

- Head of CD/WTO to announce new vision for CD/WTO that will include a new structure; an annual workplan system; job descriptions for staff; regular staff meetings; and a performance appraisal system (to be designed at Sector level) that rewards discipline, meeting deadlines, quality of work, critical thinking, and innovation.
- Appoint acting heads of General Departments and ask their opinion on placement of various staff.
- Draft CD/WTO workplan based on general department workplans
- Develop job descriptions in new structure
- Assign staff to positions in new structure
- Develop objectives and criteria for appraisal for CD/WTO staff
- Establish training system for “new” CD/WTO staff, that includes rotation and significant commercial diplomacy training
- CD/WTO staff to work closely with ATR personnel to improve work habits, critical thinking, and value-added

APPENDIX: CD/WTO Staff Review

Name	Group	Ability (5 strongest, 1 weakest)	Willingness (5 strongest, 1 weakest)	Main Strengths	Main Weaknesses	Comments
Noha Sobhy	Technical Offc.	4.5	5	-Hard worker, self-driven, leadership -Works fast and well -Good understanding of agreements -Time management	-English writing	-Noha is an excellent supervisor who should be an example for others
Amr Saleh	Technical Offc.	4	4	-People skills -Creativity	-Can get distracted -Needs to be pushed	-Amr is a good supervisor who can help him reach his goals
Hala Dakrouy	TF and TGP	4	4	-Hard worker -Discipline (always working when in the office)	-Follow-up on her tasks -Not very proactive	-Hala is a good supervisor who should be encouraged to improve her follow-up and be more proactive
Iman Fouad	TF and TGP	3	3	-[Not observed]	-English speaking/writing -Not outspoken	-Iman should keep improving based on her strengths and weaknesses. Her participation in training, for example, is mostly idle.
Noha Safwat	TF and TGP	4	4	-English speaking -Critical thinking	-Not proactive	-Noha seems like a very good potential supervisor in her environment and should fulfill it.
Doaa Sheeshaa	TF and TGP	3.5	4	-English speaking -Wants to learn	-Not yet well integrated in dept	-Doaa has very good potential as a mentor and should be more involved in CD/WTO's work
Issam Tarad	TF and TGP	2.5	4	-Knowledge of trade procedures -Good contacts in trading community	-English speaking/writing -Knowledge of WTO	-Arabic constitution is a challenge for Issam. He is related to customs and has contacts and practical guidance for staff. His task is to implement all new decrees and CD/WTO's work should be appraised of this
Iman Refaat	NAMA	4.5	4	-Quick learner -English speaking and writing -Participative management style	-Can be more proactive -Time management	-Iman is a very good supervisor who can still improve her program in terms of being more proactive and better.
Iman Ahmed	NAMA	4	4	-Quick learner -English speaking	-Can be more proactive	-Iman is a good supervisor who is more responsible and has leadership skills
Hedi Amin	NAMA	4	4	-Good understanding of textiles and HS -Enthusiasm and attitude towards work	-English speaking and writing -Analytical skills	-Hedi is a good supervisor who has intensive conversations with staff in his courses.

Name	Group	Ability (5 strongest, 1 weakest)	Willingness (5 strongest, 1 weakest)	Main Strengths	Main Weaknesses	Comments
Hani Aboulezz	NAMA	3.5	3	- English speaking - Quantitative skills - Contacts	- Discipline/absenteeism - Arabic writing - Does not like to read	- Hani has potential but is going unfulfilled - relatively good at workplan system responsibilities - positive or negative through performance simply at staff level - increase his productivity
Rania El Nady	CP and Inv.	4.5	5	- English speaking and writing - Pro-active - Management/leadership skills - Hard worker - English skills	- Understanding of economic concepts (important for her work) - English writing can still improve	- Rania is an excellent strong leader - make use of her skills, possibly in Rules since with competitive
Niveen Shaltout	CP and Inv.	3.5	4	- English skills	- Analytical skills - Can be more proactive	- Niveen seems to not enough objective - Participation in assessment work
Iman Amin	CP and Inv.	4	4	- Leadership skills - Hard worker - English speaking - Attitude towards work	- Economic concepts - English writing	- Iman has very good needs to better and trade concepts - value-added to
Mohamed El Hady	CP and Inv.	4	5	- Economic skills - Analytical skills - Hard worker - Quality of work	- English writing can improve	- Mohamed has good is a quick learner - Needs to understand whole then better his economic asset.
Nermeen	CP and Inv.	3.5	4	- English language	- Economic concepts - Analytical thinking	- Nermeen is a good Participated in assessment. - commercial director out where she added.
Mohamed Shahat	Dispute	4.5	5	- Discipline - Hard and reliable worker - Diplomatic skills - Quality of work - Friendly disposition	- Conversational English/written English - Economic concepts	- Mohamed is a good but his true potential fulfilled. Should be more proactive - managerial potential
Wael Mustafa	Dispute	3	3		- English speaking and writing - Absenteeism	- Wael can be potential English skills handicap. He needs intensive English much encouragement - Discipline needed
Mustafa Shoman	Dispute	2	2	- [Not observed]	- Arabic writing - English speaking and writing - Background on WTO - Absenteeism	- Since Mostafa appear to be very English), it is hard can add value during most of

Name	Group	Ability (5 strongest, 1 weakest)	Willingness (5 strongest, 1 weakest)	Main Strengths	Main Weaknesses	Comments
Montaser Fathy	WTO Rules	4	4.5	- Discipline - Hard and reliable worker - Critical thinking	- Mentoring of new staff - Organizational/Managerial skills	- Montaser is a good manager - Management skills - need to improve
Hussam Shawky	WTO Rules	3.5	5	- English skills - Practical legal work experience - Critical thinking	- Needs background on WTO	- Hussam has experience - Would suggest training, rotation - WTO groups, and other senior (a priori this may be better)
Mustafa Sebai	WTO Rules	3.5	5	- English skills - Critical thinking - Knows how to get information	- Needs background on WTO	- Mustafa has experience - Would suggest training, rotation - WTO groups, and other senior
Hesham Abdel Moneim	Accession	4	4	- English skills - Good understanding of WTO agreements	- Can be more proactive - Managerial skills	- Hesham is a good manager - better in a system - performance and management - praised and critical
Niveen Basta	Accession	3	3.5	- Good demeanor	- Needs more background on WTO, better understanding of economic and trade issues	- Though she seems to be learning, Niveen may not be a good fit for accession - solid understanding of the whole and knowledge of trade terms
Ahmed Tantawi	Accession	4	3.5	- English (and French) language skills - IPR training	- Economic and trade concepts	- Ahmed seems to be a good fit - He will need quick learning of economic and trade concepts in addition to WTO value in accession
Kamel Fathy	Accession	3.5	4	- English skills - Wants to learn	- Needs to focus - Needs commercial diplomacy training	- Kamel is a good fit - constant guidance - also needs more experience in accession.
Omar Ahmed	Accession	3.75	4	- English skills - Wants to learn	- Needs commercial diplomacy training	- Omar is a good fit - commercial diplomacy training - mentoring, he is a good fit for different groups
Sherif Hazem	IPR	4.5	4.5	- English skills - Experience in several WTO areas - Understanding of IPR - Self-starter, quick learner, and hard worker	- Diplomacy	- Sherif is an excellent fit - his "straight-talking" style - trouble with communication - earned the right to lead the group based on his knowledge, initiative - Since IPR is not a developed experience, he is recommended as head of that group
Mohamed Adel	IPR	4	4	- English skills - Understanding of IPR	- Can be more proactive	- Mohamed is a good fit - made very good use of his experience - makes a good fit for IPR
Ashraf Mokhtar	Deputy head	4	5	- Hard worker	- Can be more	- Ashraf has experience

Name	Group	Ability (5 strongest, 1 weakest)	Willingness (5 strongest, 1 weakest)	Main Strengths	Main Weaknesses	Comments
				-Discipline	proactive -English speaking and writing -Management skills	technically and to improve more too many man should be to fo and administra relief to head assignments s job description supervisory ca
Reham Mahmoud Shereen Sabbagh	Not yet assigned Agriculture	Not observed 4.5	Not observed 5	Not observed -Innovator -Hard worker -Passionate about work -Mentor to new people	Not observed -English speaking and writing -Economic concepts	-Not observed -Shereen is an Management : She's a role m
Azza Kamal	Agriculture	4.5	4.5	-Hard worker -Trade data manipulation and analysis -English skills	-Can be more assertive	-Azza is an exo workplan syste further increas
Miar Sherif	Agriculture	4	4.5	-Hard worker -Quick learner -English skills -Computer skills	-Needs to build broader understanding of the WTO	-Miar is a very adjusted relati CD/WTO syste Would also be in a workplan
Sherif Amer	Agriculture	4	3.5	-Did well in SPS	-Not adaptable to different managerial styles	-Though Sherif Hesham Abde made a positiv agriculture. Sh him work on b also emphasiz adapt to differ
Shimaa Bayoumi	Agriculture	4.5	4	-Broad knowledge and interest in many WTO agreements -English skills -Leadership skills	-Lost some enthusiasm and motivation	-Shimaa is a go has not fulfilled has need and
Shimaa Helmy	Agriculture	3.5	4	-Research skills	-Broader WTO knowledge -Can be more proactive	-Shimaa is a go more proactive
Rania El-Rawy	Agriculture	3	4	-Good organizational skills -Excel and Word skills	-WTO knowledge	-Rania's office extent of her k contribution in
Dina Mahmoud	Services	4.5	4.5	-English skills -Hard worker -English skills -Diplomacy and communication skills	-Time management	-Dina is an exo she has not re Management :
Mayee Amer	Services	4.5	4	-English skills -Economic skills	-Can be more proactive	-Mayee is an e could be more

Name	Group	Ability (5 strongest, 1 weakest)	Willingness (5 strongest, 1 weakest)	Main Strengths	Main Weaknesses	Comments
Marwa Kamal	Services	3.5	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Analytical skills - Desire to learn - Hard and disciplined worker 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Arabic writing skills need to improve (by her own admission) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Marwa has good CD/WTO. She is comfortable with essential that improve as it n work.
Iman El Sabaa	Services	4.5	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - English skills - Analytical skills - Outspoken - Economic skills 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Diplomacy (at times) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Iman is an excellent not as proactive. She is a natural has improved further.
Iman Abdel Kader	Services	4.5	4.5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - English skills - Analytical skills - Economic skills - Discipline 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Can be quick to judgment 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Iman is an excellent leadership and have improved
Mohamed Mahfouz	Services	4	5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Analytical skills - Work experience 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - WTO background 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Mohamed has good CD/WTO, esp services areas strength.
Luay Motamad	Trade debt and finance	3.5	3.5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Work experience - Entrepreneurial - Knowledge of effective work processes in business 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - WTO background - English skills 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Luay has very might not be h involved in imp at TAS or in p